

**Eastern Corridor Program  
Red Bank Corridor Project**

**Document from Bill Collins  
5040 Eastwood Circle West  
Cincinnati, OH 45227  
bcollins1@cinci.rr.com  
(513) 271-4425**

**Submitted to ODOT on February 15, 2012  
as part of the  
Red Bank Road Community Engagement Process**

## Purpose of this Document

The purpose of this document, along with its attached Endnotes, is to argue for a design of Red Bank Road that helps, rather than harms, the communities and employers that are located at the western end of the proposed Eastern Corridor roadway. [Endnote A](#)

To achieve this positive goal for the municipalities of Cincinnati, Fairfax and Mariemont, this document argues for a close collaboration among these municipalities and with the Ohio Department of Transportation to develop a “context-sensitive design” for Red Bank Road and its environs. [Endnote B](#)

## Preface

Design matters.

Today decisions about roads, sidewalks, setbacks and other transportation/infrastructure questions --- where and how this infrastructure is designed and what public purpose this public investment serves -- can make or break neighborhoods, cities, suburbs and entire regions. [Endnote C](#)

In our Ohio/Kentucky/Indiana Tri-State region, we see some excellent examples of good transportation/infrastructure planning as well as some very bad examples. When the infrastructure decisions were good,

- Jobs opportunities were created,
- Existing communities were strengthened and redeveloped, and
- Major new employers were recruited to and/or developed in our region. [Endnote D](#)

However, when unwise decisions were made about infrastructure investment in our Tri-State region (sometimes the unfortunate side of these decisions became more evident in retrospect, and were not as well known at the time), the following occurred: [Endnote E](#)

- Stable, established communities were destabilized and property values were undermined,
- Businesses, people and jobs have fled from those communities,
- Racial segregation increased, and
- People and jobs left the Cincinnati, Norwood, Covington, Newport, St. Bernard, Elmwood Place and other long-established municipalities, decamping not only for more distant suburbs within the Tri-State region, but unfortunately also to other metro areas both inside and outside of the USA.

This planning process for the portion of the Eastern Corridor road roadway in Fairfax, Mariemont and the City of Cincinnati is a once-in-a-generation opportunity to do something positive that will strengthen the East Side of the Cincinnati and its inner-ring suburbs for years to come.

Today in our East Side communities, as well as nationally, it is clear that positive new economic and social trends are afoot that suggest that:

- Increasingly, urban neighborhoods and older inner-ring suburbs are becoming more attractive to residential home-buyers and renters (especially the so-called “Millennial” generation or “Generation Y”), and [Endnote F](#)
- It is increasingly likely that significant economic development and job creation will accompany this increasing demand for housing in urban neighborhoods and older inner-ring suburbs. [Endnote G](#) [Endnote H](#)

Locally, these trends have manifested themselves in several ways that are becoming increasingly obvious:

- During the last 10-12 years, large-scale job-creation has happened in the Red Bank Road corridor (Fifth Third Bank, Gorilla Glue, Medpace, Forest Pharmaceutical, Ohmart Vega, Integra Life Sciences, Carespring, etc.) [Endnote I](#)
- The “white flight phenomenon” which defined residential real-estate trends on the East Side of Cincinnati from 1960 to 2000 has ended. [Endnote J](#)
- Despite many store closings and a sluggishness in retail activity throughout the Tri-State region, retail centers in this East Side area such as Rookwood Commons/Pavilion, Hyde Park Plaza, Kenwood Town Center and the traditional commercial centers of Hyde Park, Oakley and Mariemont have fared well.

For all of these reasons, I look forward to collaborating with ODOT and the City of Cincinnati on the design of the Red Bank Road, as part of the Eastern Corridor project. Through this planning process, we have an opportunity to leverage the federal and state funding on this project to improve the quality of life, enhance the local sense of place, as well as attract people, capital and jobs to these East Side communities for many years to come.

## Some specific design ideas

Other speakers tonight will address issues in regards to the Red Bank Road design that I agree with. But, before closing, I wanted to mention a few specific ideas for the road design that I believe are important.

- 1) First, in order to protect the campus of John P. Parker School, the intersection of Red Bank and Madison, as well as the intersection of Red Bank and Duck Creek roads, need to remain as level-grade intersections.
- 2) Second, at the corner of Red Bank and Duck Creek roads, I believe we need to build a pedestrian/bicycle overpass bridge that will allow Shroder High School students a safe crossing over Red Bank Road. This will also give working people in Madisonville a safe and easy non-automotive access to the thousands of jobs that Fifth Third Bank has created on Duck Creek Road.
- 3) Third, we need to recognize that the communities at this northwestern end of the Eastern Corridor project such as Mariemont, Fairfax and Madisonville are struggling to attract and keep young families. This trend was quantified in the 2010 Census data which showed that the number of residents in the 45227 zip

code under the age of 18 dropped 17 percentage points between 2000 and 2010. Also, during this same time period, the number of neighborhood public elementary schools located in this 45227 zip code area dropped from five (5) schools to just two (2) schools.

In order to make this area more attractive to families, I believe that we need to leverage the Eastern Corridor funding to create hike/bike trails along both sides of Red Bank Road that will connect to Daniel Drake Park to the north, and to Ault Park and Otto Armleder Park to the south.

Specifically, I would argue that the off-road hike/bike trail on the west side of Red Bank Road should be built alongside the banks of Duck Creek rather than directly alongside the roadway. By building this hike/bike trail along the banks of Duck Creek from Columbia Parkway north to the point where Deerfield Creek flows into Duck Creek, we would free up space along Red Bank Road for a landscaped median.

- 4) Fourth, as part of the Eastern Corridor design, ODOT may decide to replace the railroad bridge over Red Bank Road just north of Corsica Hollow. If a new bridge is built, I would suggest that it be built wide enough so that there is extra room for the single-track rail line, with enough space allocated along both sides of the railroad tracks to allow for paved hike/bike paths.

This would give pedestrians and cyclists a safe and easy way to cross over Red Bank Road. Also, the new overpass would provide the City of Cincinnati with an opportunity to leverage this overpass as an architectural Gateway to the City similar to the architectural gateway on the Seymour Avenue overpass over Interstate 75.

- - - - -

## Endnotes

### Endnote A

Most of these communities and employers lie within the City Limits of Cincinnati (Kennedy Heights, Madisonville, Oakley, Hyde Park, Mount Lookout, Linwood, Columbia-Tusculum, the East End, etc.). However, this White Paper also advocates equally for the benefit of our nearby neighbors in the “inner-ring” Cincinnati suburbs of Fairfax, Mariemont and Silverton.

### Endnote B

During the last couple of years, several excellent short videos have been produced about “context-sensitive” transportation design. These videos explain how several different U.S. communities – some urban, some suburban, some rural – have successfully collaborated with city, county and state planners and transportation authorities to create road designs that encouraged job creation and community life while also accommodating the needs of through traffic (commuters and truckers). Those community-focused videos include:

- West Palm Beach, Florida** -- [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=metP6nG\\_9fQ](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=metP6nG_9fQ) -- where the City of West Palm Beach has successfully cut crime and revitalized its downtown and Lake Worth/Intracoastal Waterway waterfront by narrowing many streets, creating new landscaped spaces and calming traffic.

Ian Lockwood, partner in the community-planning firm of Glanning Jackson. Former head of the Transportation Division for the City of West Palm Beach. “When the City reached rock bottom, about 80 % of the stores on the main shopping street were vacant, we had about \$7,000 in reserves as a City. The drug and prostitution problems were terrible. In fact, there was a documentary done on it called ‘Crack America’ that was filmed here in West Palm Beach. Our roads had become escape routes to the suburbs. All investment left the City. People became car-dependent, and then we started tearing down our buildings to make room for surface parking lots.

I was recruited as part of a group of ‘change agents’ whose mission it was to revitalize the City. I am going to take you on a tour today and show you some of those projects that, when weaved in with a whole bunch of other things that we were doing, made West Palm Beach turn from being a slum to a very nice medium-sized City.”

Next Lockwood now took viewers on an auto tour of Olive Avenue: “What we’ve done here is narrow the street down. We’ve made it two-way, put in nice wide sidewalks. These neighborhoods used to be rather hollow [photo shown of a shell of a Spanish-style house], a lot of vacant properties, and a lot of boarded-up homes. And, all those places are getting fixed up now. A lot of families are moving back into the City with their children, and because of what we’ve done with the sidewalks and the streets, the kids can now walk to school. We’ve narrowed their crossing distances. We’ve slowed down the speeders. We had speeded up our streets so much that people started building hedges and walls in front of their properties to cut them off from the street,” Lockwood said.

“And now,” he said, “the new developments engage the street, providing what we call ‘natural surveillance’ on the street which, again, helps from a crime-prevention perspective. It helps people feel comfortable as they walk along.”

Lockwood now takes viewers on an auto tour of Flagler Drive. “This is North Flagler Drive. It’s the road that parallels our waterfront. It has got a linear park on one side with a beautiful shared path. It’s a big, big improvement over what used to be here. [In the past] North Flagler Drive was just a car conduit. It was straight as a gun barrel and drivers drove like bullets. Nobody wanted to be there, and it cut the City off from its waterfront. So, getting the streets right is really important from a sustainability perspective. And getting streets right doesn’t mean speeding cars up and getting them through quickly. It means making a nice city, making a walkable city, and giving people choices, choices on how to get where they are going – not just by car, but by foot, by bike and by public transport. “

Next, takes viewers on a walking tour of Clematis Street. “This is Clematis Street. This is the historic shopping street of West Palm Beach. “It’s hard to believe [now] that this was a one-way street with signals. Today it is a narrower, slower street. It’s two-way. There is parking on both sides. There are pedestrian crossings at the narrowings mid-block and the intersections have been raised to sidewalk height to help pedestrians cross the street. We’ve also built an interactive fountain in front of the library where kids play in the water and parents come and watch, increasing what we call ‘natural surveillance.’ And, what happened was that all the prostitutes and drug dealers that used to populate this area have gone away. These stores [storefronts] used to be 80% vacant. Now they are pretty well filled. People with choice are coming down here to live above the stores. It’s really becoming a really vibrant place.

- **Trenton, New Jersey** -- [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D\\_n82Ah\\_4Qo](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D_n82Ah_4Qo) --where plans are being made to transform N.J. Route 29, a main freeway connector between I-95 and the New Jersey Turnpike, into a boulevard. In creating this boulevard, the goal is reduce traffic fatalities, re-connect the City to its Delaware River waterfront, promote walkability via cross streets that cross route 29 and encourage locals and motorists on Route 29 to patronize downtown businesses.

In the video. Ingrid Reed, a leader of the Capitol City Development Corporation said, “The cars are encouraged to speed through [today]. There is no way to really slow down the speed. We’re telling them, ‘go through Trenton as fast as you can.’ That’s what the [current] road [design] says.”

Douglas Palmer, Mayor of Trenton; “There is almost a four-mile stretch [of Route 29] before there are any traffic lights, and we had some horrific tragedies in terms of motor-vehicle fatalities, the majority by young people. And it become abundantly clear that the [New Jersey] Department of Transportation had to do something to slow traffic down.”

Mark Stout, Assistant New Jersey Transportation Commissioner, said, “I think the people in the City of Trenton and the Mayor and the people looking at downtown Trenton are looking at some way to have a state highway that doesn’t just roar by the downtown area in a freeway-type basis, but [instead] really serves and fits in as a boulevard that brings people to a redeveloped and rejuvenated downtown area.”

Ingrid Reed said, “I think we’ve learned from many places that a better balance between cars and people is good for economic development. People want to be there. People want to build there. And so the boulevard was not just a dream. It became a way of getting the economic development and revitalization that we wanted in Trenton.”
  
- **The Rochester suburb of Irondequoit, New York** -- <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=0jCXgO3Fo4I> -- where Mark McAnany, project manager for the Bergmann Associates engineering and architectural design firm explained the 2-mile, \$14 million re-do of Sea Breeze Drive from Interstate 590 to Irondequoit’s waterfront on Irondequoit Bay. “We successful transformed the corridor form a stark four-lane expressway environment into a green median divided, traffic-calmed community gateway corridor,” said McAnany, the Transportation Business Segment Leader for the 340-person Bergmann Associates firm.

“We narrowed the pavement up, and that allowed us to create additional green space and also build a two-mile-long continuous trail system that provides recreational use along the corridor but also links the neighborhoods in,” McAnany said.

“We have many sustainable design elements in the project. We have four roundabouts at four intersections along the corridor which are safer by design, but they also reduce long-term energy use, improve air quality and reduce noise levels.” McAnany added,

“We also have the pedestrian amenities an the trail system. Up at the north end [near Irondequoit Bay, which connects to Lake Ontario] we have two public parking lots that were built with a porous asphalt pavement treatment. That’s a water-quality enhancement that actually captures the first two-year rain event before any water runs off the parking lots. We also have some gateway elements. Behind us is the ship’s mast icon at the northern-most roundabout. And that’s to welcome people to the town’s waterfront district, Sea Breeze, and just re-enforces that the waterfront experience is coming towards them as they continue north along the corridor.”

- **Littleton, New Hampshire** -- <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wsMZ8Wpt8AQ> -- where town fathers, when given the green light by state authorities, actively solicited local residents for “focus group”-style input on the redesign of its Main Street (U.S. 302). In Littleton, the town used a series of landscaped medians to slow down through traffic coming into town from Interstate 93 less than one mile from downtown Littleton. At the state level, Littleton native and New Hampshire Transportation Commissioner Carol Murray encouraged Littleton officials to take the lead in designing their main street. Murray explained how, on the Littleton/U.S. 302 project, some people feared that the town (and taxpayers) would face lawsuits when the town changed parking rules, reduced the width of some streets and intersections, and slowed down through traffic in order to make its downtown safer and more business-friendly. “There are folks that will say ‘liability.’ Oh, my heavens, we [the town government or state government] are going to be sued. That’s a big resistance point. It’s not just the lawyers [that make that claim]; it’s also the engineers. I guess that’s based on the fact that if you don’t design for the maximum, [some people think] you’re liable.” She explained the legal definition of liability: “Liability only means that you are reasonable, prudent, make cautious decisions and document your thought process,” the Commissioner Murray said.

## Endnote C

In its Video “Rethinking Streets for Successful Communities,” published by the Columbus, Ohio-based Mid-Ohio Regional Planning Commission (MORPC), this question of “doing street design right” to strengthen the community and increase property values is addressed directly. In the MORPC video – see <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HbYgHwY6E9w> -- some of the professionals interviewed for this video are:

- **Carol Coletta** - former CEO of Chicago-based CEOs for Cities. [Please note that the board president-elect of CEOs for Cities is former University of Cincinnati President Nancy Zimpher.]
- **Ken Danter** - Former Director of Economic Development at the Columbus Area Chamber of Commerce and currently President of the Danter Company, a Columbus-based real-estate research company;
- **Terry Foegler** - former City Manager of the City of Dublin, Ohio, an inner-ring northern suburb of Columbus. Currently Foegler serves as Associate Vice President for Physical Planning and Real Estate at The Ohio State University.
- **Jack Lucks** - Chairman of Continental Real Estate, a large Columbus-based developer whose Tri-State area projects include the RAVE Theater Cineplex at the Streets of West Chester and the Preserve at Beckett Ridge housing development in West Chester. Locally Continental Real Estate also handles the property management at the Streets of West Chester.
- **Keith Myers** - a Columbus-based co-founder and partner in the of MSI/KKG urban/landscape design firm (with local offices in Covington, Kentucky); and
- **Yaromir Steiner** -- CEO, of Steiner & Associates, the co-designer (along with the Georgetown Company) of the award-winning Easton Town Center in Columbus. Steiner’s firm recently signed a tax-incentive agreement with Butler County in Cincinnati’s northern suburbs to build the proposed Liberty Town Square development in Liberty Township near I-75.

A partial transcript of “Rethinking Streets for Successful Communities” follows. This partial transcript includes the key portions of this video that focus on road/street design and its connection to livability and property values.

**Coletta:** “People are valuing things today that they didn’t value 10 years ago or 20 years ago. We need to know those things so that we can develop the kinds of communities that people want to live in.”

**Foegler:** “It’s so easy to think that the housing lull that we are suffering today is just a result of the 2008 problems and some problems with residential mortgage lending practices. The demographic fundamentals that are changing are having a far bigger effect.

**Foegler [continued from previous page]:** I came back to Dublin in 2008 to serve as its City Manager, and really with the same charge of looking at where it [The Town of Dublin] was at that point in time, and trying to understand how does Dublin posture itself to be competitive and sustainable going forward. Forces that had largely driven most of the growth and development of Dublin were going to be turned on their head in the next 10-20 years. There were going to be far more sellers of this kind of product [existing housing in Dublin] than there are buyers ”

**Lucks:** “In the year 2000, there were four (4) households in the buying category for every one (1) households in the selling category. By today, in 2011, that has dropped to 1.8 to 1. By 2015 it will be 1.4 to 1 and in 2020 it will be one (1) to one (1).”

**Coletta:** “Your constituents want their homes to hold their value. It’s the biggest investment they have. So, if there is no future demand for their homes, then their homes will not hold their value.”

**Lucks:** “Cities have a great advantage. They hold an enormous amount of real estate that they are not looking at correctly, and that is all the streets and all the setbacks.”

**Foegler:** “It’s real important that we get that right, because that piece of the public realm around streets, from all the designers and planners who have come in and talked to us have said that that does as much to determine the success of these places – that piece of the public realm – as anything we do.”

**Lucks:** “Redevelop it and re-improve it. Then all the land around it will drastically go up [in value]. That’s one place where community leaders already possess the power to do something really good.”

**Myers:** “The whole development pattern that [has existed] for the last 40-50 years was completely dependent on one single mode of transportation.”

**Steiner:** “Most of those spaces have been designed at auto scale. You know, the car moves at a certain speed, so you appreciate what’s around you at the speed of the car. It [needs] to be designed at a human scale.”

**Myers:** “It’s not just simply the traffic engineer that determines the character of the street. They [the traffic engineers] have a say, and what they say is important, but they are not the final arbiters of what that street looks like.”

**Foegler:** “You are going to see, I think, a lot more emphasis on and a rethinking of the typical suburban pattern.” Foegler went on to point out that, in Dublin, the town took a new approach a few years ago when it created a plan for its Bridge Street Corridor in collaboration with ODOT. [Please note that, like Red Bank Road (which connects I-71 to Columbia Parkway), Bridge Street in Dublin also connects two limited access high-speed highways (Columbus’s I-270 Outerbelt and the Route 315 Olentangy Freeway). Also, please note that after Bridge Street (U.S. Route 33) passes I-270 westbound, it becomes a limited access freeway that connects to Marysville and Bellefontaine.]

**Foegler:** “The economic development aspects of the consideration [for the new Bridge Street Corridor plan] were very, very strong. And those elements together got Dublin to look at much different model of urban development.”

**Danter:** “When I talk to communities, that’s what’s first and foremost in their minds. . . . They begin to think about their downtowns. There is a desire to improve their downtowns. There is also a desire on the part of the population to want to live in that more urban environment. It’s not for everybody, but certainly there is a sizable component of the population that likes that idea.”

**Steiner:** “Knowledge-based people want to come and create businesses. So, if you want to be a city that thrives, that does well, you have to be a place that is desirable to live [in]. And you are not going to be a desirable place to live unless you make it beautiful, unless you make it attractive, unless you create that sense of scale that people like to come to.”

**Danter:** “I don’t believe that in Central Ohio we’re going to get back to a point where we were eight or nine or ten years ago, or even 15 years ago.”

**Coletta:** “We always have to think about future-proofing out communities: how will our community have value, hold value, grow value.”

**Foegler:** “When we do design streets, the recognition that these streets -- regardless of what they are connecting or how dense the pattern is around them -- making them as walkable, making them as accommodating to all the forms of transportation as they can be, to encourage livability where appropriate along those streets it’s real important that we get that right.”



## Endnote D

In recent years, perhaps the best local example of good “context-sensitive” transportation planning and urban design occurred in the 1990s when Fort Washington Way (I-71) between Downtown Cincinnati and the Ohio River riverfront was placed in a trench. With this new design, two new landscaped one-way boulevards (2<sup>nd</sup> Street one-way eastbound and 3<sup>rd</sup> Street one-way westbound) were built alongside Fort Washington Way at street level, freeing up a large amount of land that previously in this area that had previously been used for I-71 on-ramps and off-ramps. With this new design, Downtown Cincinnati was tied closer to its riverfront in a manner that was pedestrian- friendly and easier for motorists to navigate. Especially during the last 3-4 years, this new transportation design has played an important role in stimulating new investment along the riverfront, attracting corporations to relocate their offices from Northern Kentucky to Downtown Cincinnati, and in generating demand for new restaurants and entertainment venues.

## Endnote E

As was the case in so many other U.S. communities, a large number transportation and infrastructure decisions were made in Greater Cincinnati during the 20<sup>th</sup> Century (particularly after 1940 when auto travel became dominant mode of transportation) that hindsight shows us were unwise and unfortunate. These unfortunate decisions often had the effect of undermining established communities, driving people and jobs away, depressing property values and thus encouraging the growth of crime and anti-social behavior. In the bullet points below, I have cited just a few of these decisions that were made affecting Madisonville and the East Side of the City of Cincinnati generally.

In describing these decisions, I am not suggesting that any people or any institutions be “blamed” for these decisions. Rather, I am providing this historical information to frame the current decisions that will be made in 2012 re: the Eastern Corridor highway. Although it is clear that the Eastern Corridor project will not be able to correct all of the issues cited in the following bullet points, I think it is clear that some of these issues can be fixed or ameliorated as part of the Eastern Corridor project. Specifically:

- Madisonville’s extensive transportation connections to Cincinnati and Norwood from the late 19<sup>th</sup> Century through the 1940s/1950s:

At the time when Madisonville was annexed by the City of Cincinnati in 1911 and for various periods of time during the next 3-4 decades, Madisonville was connected to key locations in the cities of Cincinnati and Norwood by four (4) gateway roads that entered Madisonville from the west, as well as by three (3) different streetcar lines (The “Swing Line,” the “Milford Line” and the Erie Avenue Cincinnati streetcar) and one well-connected commuter-rail line. This excellent infrastructure tied Madisonville to Cincinnati and to Norwood at a time when the Cincinnati, Fairfax, Norwood, St. Bernard and the other Mill Creek Valley communities were brimming with manufacturing jobs that employed local people in large numbers and attracted young families to the area.

- The Swing Line inter-urban streetcar line, a precursor to the Eastern Corridor road concept: During its short life (see <http://www.indianhill.org/History/Hist020.htm> ) until the early 1920, the “Swing Line” inter-urban streetcar line (popularly identified by the line’s owners, the Swing family, but legally known as the Cincinnati & Columbus or “C & C” line) from Norwood to Owensville was a high-speed inter-urban streetcar line that whisked commuters from Owensville, Milford, Terrace Park, Madeira and Madisonville to factories in Norwood such as Allis-Chalmers (now Siemens Energy & Automation) and U.S. Playing Card. Until 1913, the Swing Line extended farther to the east beyond Owensville, all the way to Hillsboro in Highland County. This transportation line is particularly relevant to today’s discussion of the Eastern Corridor roadway because, even though the Swing family never completed construction of this line all the way to Columbus (the railroads already offered this passenger service from Cincinnati to Columbus), this vital transportation service did follow the path of the proposed Eastern Corridor roadway very closely.

It did this by connecting the Duck Creek Valley in Norwood and Madisonville (where I-71 is

located today between the Kennedy/Highland/Ridge interchange and the Norwood Lateral interchange) to Milford and Owensville in Clermont County (located near UC-Clermont, just two miles from the Route 32 Appalachian Highway by way of Bauer Road).

According to this link -- <http://jjakucyk.com/transit/interurbaninfo.html#cc> -- under the title, "Interurban & Suburban Railway Information," the Swing Line entered Madisonville from the west along Duck Creek and Madison roads before turning north of Whetsel Avenue, then east on Chandler Street, and next north to Madeira along a right-of-way that paralleled today's Oasis Line railway line from Madisonville to Madeira. From Madeira the Swing Line passed through Indian Hill's Redbird Hollow (where a privately maintained nature trail exists today) to Terrace Park and then to Milford and Owensville along today's U.S. Route 50.

In Madisonville, the Swing Line connected with the Cincinnati Street Railway's Erie Avenue Streetcar Line (the #69 streetcar) at the corner of Madison and Whetsel in Madisonville.

According to this source -- again see <http://jjakucyk.com/transit/interurbaninfo.html#cc> -- Clermont County and Highland County commuters served by the Swing Line were upset when a bridge washout disrupted service in 1913. This document states, "There was pressure [after the 1913 washout] from the citizens of Madisonville, Madeira, and Ramona (a small community at Drake and Shawnee Run Road in today's Indian Hill) to keep the line, because it was a fast way to get to the factories in Norwood where many residents worked. Since most of the streetcar lines ran radially from downtown, taking the street railway would involve going to Walnut Hills [at Peebles Corner] and back out [to Norwood]. That trip would take some 45 minutes, instead of 10 on the C&C.

Unfortunately, the Cincinnati Street Railway had no interest in that, and residents were left to fend for themselves. The people of Hillsboro were the most invested in preserving operations, since the Norfolk & Western and Baltimore & Ohio branches to their town provided horribly inadequate service, generally just one shuttle each way to Sardinia or Blanchester per day. Nonetheless, on October 25, 1919 the last car ran on the outer 30 miles of the C&C between Owensville and Hillsboro."

- The Milford Line inter-urban streetcar line, another precursor to the Eastern Corridor concept:  
The Cincinnati, Milford and Blanchester Line -- more often referred to as the "Milford Line" -- was an inter-urban street line which the "Interurban & Suburban Railway Information" document [again, see <http://jjakucyk.com/transit/interurbaninfo.html#cc>] explains ran from Milford to Madisonville from 1903 until 1936. [From 1906 to 1926, this line offered service all the way out to Blanchester in Clinton County.]  
In effect, the passenger service provided by the Milford line was a precursor to the planned Eastern Corridor commuter rail line, because the Milford Line connected seamlessly to the Cincinnati Street Railway streetcar lines that connected to Downtown Cincinnati.  
In the vicinity of Mariemont, Fairfax and Madisonville, the Milford Line's right of way followed alongside Murray Road and Murray Avenue until it passed through Mariemont, past the current location of Mariemont High School and extended its right of way to the path of today's Wooster Pike. [Today portions of this section of the old Milford Line inter-urban streetcar right of way are used by the Murray Road hike/bike trail, which may be extended through Mariemont as the "Mariemont Extension" to connect with the Little Miami Scenic Trail at Newtown Road. See <http://www.connectcincy.org/mariemont-extension>] for details.  
The western terminus of the Milford Line was in Madisonville near the corner of Brotherton Road and Erie Court (behind and to the south of the Marathon gas station on Red Bank Road). At this location, travellers commuting into Cincinnati could transfer (with shelter provided) to the Erie Avenue Streetcar line that was operated by the Cincinnati Street Railway Company.
- Cincinnati Street Railway network:  
This map -- <http://homepage.mac.com/jjakucyk/Transit1/map.html> -- shows in black the network of streetcars operating in the City of Cincinnati prior to the 1950s when the last of the streetcar lines were shut down. From Madisonville, the #69 streetcar line started at the Madisonville loop (today's Metro bus loop) at the corner of Madison Road and Kenwood Road.

From this Madisonville loop (which sat right across Madison Road from the East Madisonville commuter-rail station), this inbound #69 streetcar line followed Madison Road to Whetsel, then turned south on Whetsel to Bramble Avenue.

The inbound #69 line followed Bramble to Erie Avenue, and then followed Erie to the connection point with the Milford Inter-urban streetcar line (near the intersection of Erie Court and Brotherton Road in today's Red Bank Corridor).

From that connection point, the streetcar line provided extensive service throughout the Greater Cincinnati area, continuing inbound on Erie Avenue through East Hyde Park, Hyde Park and O'Bryonville with connections at DeSales Corner (Woodburn and Madison) and at Peebles Corner (Gilbert Avenue and McMillan Street) to downtown Cincinnati, the University of Cincinnati campus, the Cincinnati Zoo, Norwood, etc.

Along this #69 route, riders also had the option of making a connection at the corner of Erie and Delta in Hyde Park to connect with Downtown Cincinnati. They could do this by taking the Delta streetcar #68 through Mount Lookout Square to the East End, where they could connect to the inbound #28 streetcar down Eastern Avenue to Downtown.

For people who lived in Oakley, they could travel inbound on the #70 streetcar, a line that ended at the loop on the eastern side of Oakley Square at Cincinnati Milacron (where today we see the new landscaped median at the eastern end of the Oakley Square streetscape on Madison Road). At this #70 streetcar loop site at Cincinnati Milacron, the Oakley commuter-rail station was located a short 50-meter walk away.

- Commuter-rail connecting Madisonville and Oakley to East Norwood and Downtown Cincinnati: According to many sources -- including page 50 of the book "Bond Hill: Origin and Transformation of a 19<sup>th</sup> Century Cincinnati Railroad Suburb" by Aharon N. Varady (see <http://tinyurl.com/7chqjep>) and the "Map of Cincinnati's Streetcars, Interurbans and Railroads" at <http://homepage.mac.com/jjakucyk/Transit1/map70.jpeg>, Madisonville and Oakley were well-served by both commuter-rail service and freight-service for many decades. Freight service continues today.

As a commuter-rail line, passenger service on this line (a rail line now that is today operated by the Indiana & Ohio Railroad which, in Norwood and Bond Hill, roughly parallels the Norwood Lateral freeway) ran inbound from Loveland and Madeira, through Madisonville and Oakley on to Norwood, Bond Hill, the Ivorydale junction in St. Bernard (where Procter & Gamble employed thousands of workers at the Ivorydale complex), and Chester Park (today's Spring Grove Village). From Chester Park (where streetcar connections were available on the Spring Grove Avenue line to factories up and down the Mill Creek Valley) the commuter-rail line extended to Downtown Cincinnati at the old Plum Street passenger-rail station.

With this extensive commuter-rail network, Madisonville was fortunate enough to have two passenger stations – East Madisonville and Madisonville – along this old Baltimore & Ohio line. The East Madisonville passenger station was located on the south side of Madison Road where the rail line crosses Madison (across the street from the Cincinnati Street Railway's #69 streetcar loop and today's Metro bus loop). The Madisonville passenger station was located along the tracks just west of the Roe Street crossing.

The Oakley station is still located today across the tracks from the Cincinnati Milacron plant within a short walking distance of Madison Road and the #70 streetcar loop. As mentioned earlier, the East Norwood station was located immediately south of today's Norwood Lateral where Forest Avenue crosses. [If the Cincinnati subway had been completed rather than abandoned during its construction, this East Norwood station would have sat immediately above the subway line, making this subway/commuter-rail station within easy walking distance of the GM-Norwood, Allis-Chalmers and U.S. Playing Card factories into one of the largest public-transportation hubs in the Tri-State region.]

- Madisonville's loss of two of its four gateway roads to Cincinnati and Norwood:  
 Prior to 1942, Madisonville was connected directly to Cincinnati and Norwood by four gateway roads: Duck Creek Road, Madison Road, Brotherton Road, and Madison Road. Today Madisonville only connects directly to Cincinnati and Norwood with two gateway streets: Madison and Erie. That represents a net loss of two gateway streets.  
 The direct connection from Madisonville to Brotherton Road ended apparently in 1942 when the bridge carrying Brotherton Road over Duck Creek and the level-grade crossing with the north/south rail line paralleling Duck Creek were closed off. At this same time in 1942 (see <http://jjakucyk.com/transit/#csr>) through streetcar service from Mariemont to downtown Cincinnati was eliminated.  
 This curtailment of east/west connections to Madisonville in 1942 occurred, as best I can tell, when the road configuration in this area was changed to accommodate automotive traffic to and from the new Ford Motor Company transmission plant in Fairfax (at today's site of a Walmart store). With this reconfiguration of streets, eastbound Brotherton Road traffic was redirected to Rosslyn Drive and to Rosslyn's intersection with Erie Avenue. From there, eastbound traffic now turns left today on Erie Avenue to cross the new (in 1942) Erie Avenue viaduct over the railroad tracks, Duck Creek and Red Bank Road. Please note that the road that today is called "Red Bank Road" was called Dunbar Road from 1911 until 1941.
- The special case of Duck Creek Road, Lyons Junior High and the Northeast Expressway (I-71):  
 As mentioned above, for much of its history, Duck Creek Road was the northernmost of the four direct gateway roads that connected Madisonville residents to jobs in Cincinnati and Norwood. Before Duck Creek Road was, in effect, chopped up into the six unconnected pieces that we see today (two road fragments in Madisonville, three road fragments in Norwood and one road fragment in Evanston), Duck Creek Road connected directly with Chandler Street, an east/west street in Madisonville that parallels Madison Road.  
 From its connection with Chandler Street, Duck Creek Road extended westward through the campus of today's John P. Parker School where it crossed Red Bank Road and began to run alongside the banks of Duck Creek for several miles to the west, ending at Montgomery Road in Evanston next to the Jewish Cemetery and St. Mark's Catholic Church..  
 Before the road was chopped into pieces, westbound Duck Creek Road passed Kennedy Avenue, as it does today, but then extended westward through the valley alongside Duck Creek past Cincinnati Milacron and behind the U.S. Playing Card plant.  
 Today in Norwood we see three unconnected sections of Duck Creek Road alongside I-71, with most of the former Duck Creek Road right-of-way taken by ODOT in the 1970s to build what planners called the Northeast Expressway (I-71).  
 Prior to this demise of the connected Duck Creek Road in the 1970s due to the construction of the I-71 freeway, the link in Madisonville between Chandler Street and Duck Creek Road was terminated in the mid-1950s. This occurred when the Cincinnati Public Schools took the land along Duck Creek Road between Anderson Place and Red Bank Road to build Lyons Junior High School at the site of today's John P. Parker School.
- Lack of a full interchange on I-71 at Exit 10 (Stewart Road): On Interstate 71, almost all of the interchanges from Montgomery Road (Exit 12) to Downtown Cincinnati have unique configurations that do not conform to modern standards for highway interchanges along Interstate highways. To correct one of those design shortcomings on I-71, the City of Cincinnati is currently working with ODOT to create a new full-scale interchange where Martin Luther King Drive crosses over I-71, with the goal of stimulating development in the Walnut Hills, Avondale and East Walnut Hills neighborhoods that are located in this vicinity.  
 Along this 12-mile stretch of I-71, there are two partial interchanges (Exit 10/Stewart Road and Exit 11/Kenwood Road) that do not allow southbound I-71 traffic (traffic coming in from the suburbs) to access those roads and do not allow traffic on those roads to access I-71 North (headed out to the suburbs).

At both of these I-71 exits (Kenwood Road and Stewart Road), commuters travelling to/from downtown Cincinnati can access the southbound lanes of I-71 for their morning commutes, and can exit northbound I-71 during their evening commute. However, at Kenwood road this is not a serious issue because Exit 12 (Montgomery Road) is easily accessible to Kenwood Road traffic via the nearby intersection of Kenwood Road and Montgomery Road.

It seems clear that these configurations of the Kenwood Road and Stewart Road interchanges were designed in the 1960s with the assumption that future development would remain concentrated in the City of Cincinnati, and would *not* flow out to the suburbs as so much of it has done during the last 40 years. Thus, today the potential for development to expand in Madisonville and in Silverton along Exit 10 has been stunted by this lack of ability for suburbanites to access Madisonville and Silverton via I-71.

In this document, I am *not* arguing that ODOT should today come back and build a complete interchange at Exit 10. This is a complex issue, and I would never argue for new construction at Exit 10 unless Madisonville residents and Silverton town officials were to decide to study this question thoroughly with extensive public input. However, I am making this contemporary point about the stunted development at Exit 10 as part of this larger point re: how many past decisions by local and state government agencies about roads, railroads, public transit, etc. have *not* been made (at least in retrospect) with the benefit of the Madisonville community sufficiently in mind.

## Endnote F

*On Common Ground*, Summer 2010 – published twice each year by the National Association of Realtors – “What’s On Deck: Retail Development,” Pages 4-8. See <http://tinyurl.com/6wewdnw> “ ‘Especially now, Generation Y is paying more careful attention to whether buying a home is a good idea and, if so, where to buy,’ says Arthur C. Nelson, presidential professor and director of the Metropolitan Research Center at the University of Utah.

Generation Y’s attitude is more than a response to vanishing equity, rising foreclosures and tight credit. It also reflects a different set of priorities than the ones that led baby boomers to gravitate to farther and farther away suburbs. . . . In survey after survey, today’s 20-somethings — the leading edge of Generation Y — express a strong desire to live in urban environments close to jobs, entertainment and each other — at least until they start having children but perhaps beyond. . . . Certainly the transformation of many city centers from decaying to desirable hasn’t escaped Generation Y. And neither has the fact that homes in city centers and inner suburbs have held their value far better than those in outer suburbs. . . .

Elwood Carlson [Charles B. Nam professor in the sociology of population at Florida State University] calls Generation Y ‘the New Boomers.’ The name captures two key characteristics of Generation Y — it contains a large number of new Americans who have immigrated to this country and it brims with the offspring of baby boomers. That one-two punch will make the New Boomers “the demographic center of gravity of American society” through at least the first half of this century,’ Carlson says. . . .

Surveys by RCLCO [Robert Charles Lesser & Company, a Washington, DC-based real-estate advisory and research firm] and another real estate advisory firm, the Concord Group, show how strongly Generation Y is in tune with many key strategies of smart growth. The most telling result: 77 percent of the New Boomers surveyed by RCLCO said they plan to live in an urban core. . . . Walkable communities with a mix of uses is another building block of smart growth. Two-thirds of the New Boomers surveyed by RCLCO said that living in a community where they could walk to work, shopping and entertainment is important, and one-third said they would pay more to do it. Smart growth also encourages compact development. More than half of RCLCO survey respondents said they would trade lot size for proximity to shopping or work. Even among families with children, one-third said they would make that trade-off. Providing transportation choices is yet one more smart growth principle that New Boomers like. In the Concord Group Survey, 81 percent said it was very or somewhat important to live near alternative modes of transit such as bus and rail lines and 67 percent said they would pay a premium to do it.”

## Endnote G

*On Common Ground*, Summer 2011 -- published twice each year by the National Association of Realtors  
– “What’s On Deck: Retail Development,” page 40-43 see <http://tinyurl.com/7daryyt>

“The retail sector has taken a beating over the past few years, leading to a 13 percent vacancy rate in 2010, according to George Ratiu, an economist at the National Assn. of Realtors.

‘We’ll see big changes in retail development in the next five years,’ says Edward Shriver, AIA, a 30-year retail veteran and principal with Strada, a Pittsburgh-based architecture and urban design firm. ‘Because of the great recession, we’re losing retailers, and the whole economy has to make changes in how retail is done in terms of who’s doing what and where.’

Change in retail is starting with the transformation of malls. ‘We’ve overdeveloped our retail in this country . . .’ says Midge McCauley, a principal at Seattle-based Downtown Works, which performs market research, retail merchandise mix strategies, and plans for street-oriented retail in urban and neighborhood centers. ‘Instead of new construction starts, you’re seeing the remalling of America, which is the redevelopment of existing properties. It goes a step beyond renovating. Some malls have run their economic lifespan and now have to reinvent themselves. The land is worth so much more than when it was purchased that it’s worth it for the owners.’

Enclosed malls are passé, and owners of less-successful malls are turning their properties into lifestyle centers. ‘They’re open-air centers with upscale tenants that generally have more amenities than strip centers. . . . Developers have been trying to recreate what has occurred naturally in towns, and many have been called town centers because they’re really faux town centers.’

The future will be dominated by retail nested in those natural or synthetic towns. ‘There’s a major shift for people to want to live, work, go to school and play right in urban centers,’ says Max Reim, co-managing partner and founding principal LiveWorkLearnPlay, a consulting and development group in Montreal. ‘Within urban centers, the most vibrant of all are urban villages. . . . We’re seeing that happening in much smaller, mid-sized cities, where small neighborhoods are integrated with each other and create a much healthier ecosystem.’

What’s driving the shift toward urban villages? Young women — whom Reim says represent 63 percent of the college population in North America — are taking on more decision-making and want to shop in urban villages. ‘Cities, towns and states,’ adds Reim, ‘are developing and enticing businesses, colleges, health care facilities, and much, much more to their downtown cores, which brings in people 24/7/365.’ . . .

The opportunity for socializing is at the heart of mixed-use and urban villages. They’ll retain fundamental concepts like the great coffee shop and bakery, along with the great inn, pub or hotel, says Reim. They’ll also include unique local retailers and mom-and-pop restaurants that can be found only in that village.

Developers will supplement new urban villages with entertainment and activity-based retail. Entertainment activities have been growing in malls, but retail centers have only recently begun to include activity-based retail. . . . “Today the most successful retail centers are those that encourage people to spend more time and visit with more frequency. Whether they spend no money or as much as possible, people beget people,” [Reim said].

Reim says developers should be programming at least 20 to 40 percent of experiential retail concepts into their centers. ‘Those include fitness centers and yoga studios, health-care centers for things like physiotherapy, and much, much more so it’s not just about selling something but about things to do,’ he explains. . . .

Bill Morris, a principal at the retail acquisition firm Morris Capital Partners in Fort Worth, Texas, says retail is mirroring the trend of ‘placemaking’ in residential development. ‘Malls have to offer something different than they did 30 years ago,’ he says. ‘They have to be a place for the whole family, not just for teenagers. That can be accomplished by adding restaurants, entertainment, grocery stores and discounters. Malls will also have more appealing amenities, such as open-air components, outdoor seating areas, water features, soft-seating areas, and other placemaking ideas.’ “

## Endnote H

“Death of the Fringe Suburb,” by Christopher B. Leinberger, an op-ed piece published in the **New York Times** November 26, 2011. Leinberger is a professor of urban and regional planning at the University of Michigan. See <http://tinyurl.com/82x7qbq>

“DRIVE through any number of outer-ring suburbs in America, and you’ll see boarded-up and vacant strip malls, surrounded by vast seas of empty parking spaces. These forlorn monuments to the real estate crash are not going to come back to life, even when the economy recovers. And that’s because the demand for the housing that once supported commercial activity in many exurbs isn’t coming back, either.

By now, nearly five years after the housing crash, most Americans understand that a mortgage meltdown was the catalyst for the Great Recession, facilitated by [the] under regulation of finance and reckless risk-taking. Less understood is the divergence between center cities and inner-ring suburbs on one hand, and the suburban fringe on the other.

It was predominantly the collapse of the car-dependent suburban fringe that caused the mortgage collapse.

In the late 1990s, high-end outer suburbs contained most of the expensive housing in the United States, as measured by price per square foot, according to data I analyzed from the Zillow real estate database. Today, the most expensive housing is in the high-density, pedestrian-friendly neighborhoods of the center city and inner suburbs. Some of the most expensive neighborhoods in their metropolitan areas are Capitol Hill in Seattle; Virginia Highland in Atlanta; German Village in Columbus, Ohio, and Logan Circle in Washington. Considered slums as recently as 30 years ago, they have been transformed by gentrification.

Simply put, there has been a profound structural shift — a reversal of what took place in the 1950s, when drivable suburbs boomed and flourished as center cities emptied and withered.

The shift is durable and lasting because of a major demographic event: the convergence of the two largest generations in American history, the baby boomers (born between 1946 and 1964) and the millennials (born between 1979 and 1996), which today represent half of the total population.

Many boomers are now empty nesters and approaching retirement. Generally this means that they will downsize their housing in the near future. Boomers want to live in a walkable urban downtown, a suburban town center or a small town, according to a recent survey by the National Association of Realtors.

The millennials are just now beginning to emerge from the nest — at least those who can afford to live on their own. This coming-of-age cohort also favors urban downtowns and suburban town centers — for lifestyle reasons and the convenience of not having to own cars.

Over all, only 12 percent of future homebuyers want the drivable suburban-fringe houses that are in such oversupply, according to the Realtors survey. This lack of demand all but guarantees continued price declines. Boomers selling their fringe housing will only add to the glut. Nothing the federal government can do will reverse this.

Many drivable-fringe house prices are now below replacement value, meaning the land under the house has no value and the sticks and bricks are worth less than they would cost to replace. This means there is no financial incentive to maintain the house; the next dollar invested will not be recouped upon resale. Many of these houses will be converted to rentals, which are rarely as well maintained as owner-occupied housing. Add the fact that the houses were built with cheap materials and methods to begin with, and you see why many fringe suburbs are turning into slums, with abandoned housing and rising crime.

The good news is that there is great pent-up demand for walkable, centrally located neighborhoods in cities like Portland, Denver, Philadelphia and Chattanooga, Tenn. The transformation of suburbia can be seen in places like Arlington County, Virginia, Bellevue, Washington, and Pasadena, California, where strip malls have been bulldozed and replaced by higher-density mixed-use developments with good transit connections.

Reinvesting in America’s built environment — which makes up a third of the country’s assets — and reviving the construction trades are vital for lifting our economic growth rate.

[Disclosure: I am the president of Locus, a coalition of real estate developers and investors and a project of Smart Growth America, which supports walkable neighborhoods and transit-oriented development.]

Some critics will say that investment in the built environment risks repeating the mistake that caused the recession in the first place. That reasoning is as faulty as saying that technology should have been neglected after the dot-com bust, which precipitated the 2001 recession.

The cities and inner-ring suburbs that will be the foundation of the recovery require significant investment at a time of government retrenchment. Bus and light-rail systems, bike lanes and pedestrian improvements — what traffic engineers dismissively call ‘alternative transportation’ — are vital. So is the repair of infrastructure like roads and bridges. Places as diverse as Los Angeles, Phoenix, Salt Lake City, Dallas, Charlotte, Denver and Washington have recently voted to pay for “alternative transportation,” mindful of the dividends to be reaped. As Congress works to reauthorize highway and transit legislation, it must give metropolitan areas greater flexibility for financing transportation, rather than mandating that the vast bulk of the money can be used only for roads.

For too long, we over-invested in the wrong places. Those retail centers and subdivisions will never be worth what they cost to build. We have to stop throwing good money after bad. It is time to instead build what the market wants: mixed-income, walkable cities and suburbs that will support the knowledge economy, promote environmental sustainability and create jobs.”

### **Endnote I**

This area where Ohmart Vega, Forest Pharmaceutical, Medpace, Gorilla Glue and Carespring are located is sometimes referred to in City of Cincinnati documents the “Madisonville Industrial Corridor.” Much of this area overlaps with the area that ODOT refers to as the Eastern Corridor Phase #1 planning area. The City of Cincinnati produced its most recent planning document on the Madisonville Industrial Corridor in 1991. Please note that parts of this Madisonville Industrial Corridor lie in areas that the City of Cincinnati defines as Madisonville and part of this area (along and near Rosslyn Drive) lies in areas that the City of Cincinnati defines as Oakley.

Also please note that during the period immediately after I-71 was built, the City of Cincinnati planned the redevelopment the old Eastwood Village area (between Duck Creek Road and I-71, immediately west of Red Bank Road) as a redevelopment project that was separate and distinct from the Madisonville Industrial Corridor. Today the Fifth Third Bank Madisonville campus occupies most of this land.

Together, between these two developments – the Madisonville Industrial Corridor and the old Eastwood Village area -- many thousands of jobs have been created in Madisonville and Oakley during the last ten years.



## Endnote J

“Hamilton County Stable Integrated Communities: 2010 Update“ -- <http://www.cincyfairhousing.com/pdfs/Final%20DN2%20Report.pdf> -- by Charles F. Casey-Leininger, Ph.D. of Casey-Leininger Research, research commissioned by Housing Opportunities Made Equal (HOME) as part of its “Hidden Treasures: Stable Integrated Communities Program” (see <http://chrc.us/ForumFlyer.pdf>).

On page 6-7, the report quantifies, using U.S. Census Data, the move away from “white flight” in Kennedy Heights. It says, “Indeed, in our earlier research we discovered that the Cincinnati neighborhood of Kennedy Heights had clearly maintained stable racial integration even though its black population exceeded 60% after 1970. In fact, from 1980 to 2000, it remained at a steady 75% black . . . . By 2010, its black population had declined to 69%.”

On page 10, the report says, “Two other neighborhoods saw modest . . . increases in their white percentages . . . In Northside, whites increased by 1% to 59%, blacks decreased 3% to 36% . . . Madisonville saw an increase of 2% white to 38%, while the black population dropped 3% to 57% bringing it below 60% black for the first time since 1980 when it equaled 56%.”